

be extended toward the ocean. Another commenter stated that this unit was proposed due to the presence of one occurrence of *Pleomele hawaiiensis*.

*Our Response:* Unit Hawaii P was proposed as critical habitat for one species, *Pleomele hawaiiensis*; however, the entire area proposed for this species has been removed. This change was made because we determined that this unit is not essential to the conservation of this species because it has a lower proportion of associated native species than other areas we consider to be essential to the conservation of this species and because there are 10 other locations that have been designated to meet the recovery goal of 8 to 10 populations throughout its historical range on this island.

(32) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, stated that unit Hawaii Q should be extended to match the Manuka NAR boundary, with the southern boundary moved to the south-southeast (to the 200-meter elevation contour) and concurrent with the Manuka NAR southeastern boundary.

*Our Response:* This unit was proposed as critical habitat for six species: *Colubrina oppositifolia*, *Diellia erecta*, *Flueggea neowawraea*, *Gouania vitifolia*, *Neraudia ovata*, and *Pleomele hawaiiensis*. Modifications were made to this unit to remove areas that do not contain the primary constituent elements for these species. The portions not included were not essential to the conservation of these species because they have a lower proportion of associated native species than other areas we consider to be essential to the conservation of these species, and there are at least eight other locations that have been designated to meet the recovery goal of 8 to 10 populations throughout their historical ranges. We did not add any area to this unit because there is enough habitat to provide 10 populations throughout the historical ranges of each of these species.

(33) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, stated that the boundary of unit Hawaii R should be moved south to match up the with the boundary of State lands at Honomalino.

*Our Response:* The northern boundary of unit Hawaii R was moved south to include only the South Kona Forest Reserve.

(34) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, provided information that unit Hawaii T contains habitat for *Clermontia*

*lindseyana*, so critical habitat for this species should be added the unit.

*Our Response:* *Clermontia lindseyana* is currently found on Maui and the island of Hawaii. Critical habitat for two populations was designated on Maui and habitat for eight populations is designated for this species on the island of Hawaii in this rule. Therefore, additional populations were not deemed essential.

(35) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, provided information that unit Hawaii W is not currently occupied by wild individuals of *Delissea undulata* but does contain historical habitat for this species and for *Zanthoxylum hawaiiense*.

*Our Response:* Unit Hawaii W was proposed as critical habitat for one species, *Delissea undulata*. The entire area proposed for this species was excluded. Portions of this unit are not essential to the conservation of this species. We excluded the proposed critical habitat on Kamehameha Schools lands in this area because the benefits of excluding these lands outweighed the benefits of including them in critical habitat (see “Analysis of Impacts Under Section 4(b)(2)”). These excluded lands are still essential and provide habitat for three populations of *Delissea undulata*. There is habitat designated elsewhere on the island of Hawaii for this species, providing habitat for two populations. *Delissea undulata* is known historically on Maui and is currently found on Kauai and the island of Hawaii. In addition to the designation in this rule, we have also designated critical habitat on Kauai (habitat for three populations). *Zanthoxylum hawaiiense* is known historically on Lanai and is currently found on Kauai, Molokai, Maui, and the island of Hawaii. We designated critical habitat for this species on Kauai (habitat for two populations), Molokai (habitat for one population), and Maui (habitat for one population). There is additional habitat for six populations of *Zanthoxylum hawaiiense* on the island of Hawaii in the excluded PTA lands (see “Analysis of Impacts Under Section 4(b)(2)”).

(36) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, provided information that unit Hawaii X contains *Phyllostegia velutina* (in Honuaua Forest Reserve).

*Our Response:* Two critical habitat units for *Phyllostegia velutina* are designated in this rule for a total of 10 populations. Although the habitat in the Honuaua Forest Reserve may be important for the conservation of this

species, it is not considered to be essential.

(37) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, suggested that *Pleomele hawaiiensis* be added to unit Hawaii Y1 and *Caesalpinia kavaensis* added to unit Hawaii Y2.

*Our Response:* *Caesalpinia kavaensis* is not included in the court order, and therefore was not included in this rulemaking. There is habitat designated elsewhere on the island of Hawaii for *Pleomele hawaiiensis* for 10 populations. Although the habitat in the Honuaua Forest Reserve may be important for the conservation of this species, it is not essential.

(38) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, stated that much of unit Hawaii Z contains badly degraded areas, and these areas should be excluded from designation, as they are currently being managed for hunting, ranching, and other multiple use programs that may not be compatible with plant critical habitat management.

*Our Response:* Unit Hawaii Z was proposed as critical habitat for 12 species: *Bonamia menziesii*, *Colubrina oppositifolia*, *Cyanea stictophylla*, *Delissea undulata*, *Flueggea neowawraea*, *Hibiscadelphus hualalaiensis*, *Hibiscus brackenridgei*, *Nothocestrum breviflorum*, *Phyllostegia velutina*, *Plantago hawaiiensis*, *Pleomele hawaiiensis*, and *Zanthoxylum dipetalum* var. *tomentosum*. Modifications were made to this unit to exclude areas that do not contain the primary constituent elements for these species or are not essential to the conservation of these species. Some portions removed are not essential to the conservation of these species because they have a lower proportion of associated native species than other areas we consider to be essential to the conservation of these species, and there are at least 8 other locations that have been designated to meet the recovery goal of 8 to 10 populations throughout their historical ranges on this and other islands.

(39) *Comment:* The Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, a State agency, stated that much of unit Hawaii AA is badly degraded; dominated by weedy, fire-prone vegetation; and is currently being managed for hunting, which may not be compatible with plant critical habitat management. The commenter also suggested that the lower boundary of this unit be at the 3,500-foot elevation level and configured in accordance with